Shine the Light On It *Part III*
May 3, 2012
Notes

Disclaimer: These notes are not intended to be an "official" record of the Networking Event, nor are they verbatim. Rather, they are meant to give the reader a review of each presenter's key points.

Michelle's Welcome: Directed everyone to new CET website, www.camridgema.gov/DHSP2/CET.cfm ; she stressed the importance of filling out on-line evaluation, www.surveymonkey.com/s/C3QYSMY after today's session; and directed everyone to the new CET brochure.

Agenda: Michelle reviewed that today we will:
- Recap last two ABBOT reports
- Hear some current data collected by Cliff Cook about the ABB community in Cambridge
- Review the 4 dimensions, and Paul Marcus and Donna Bivens will lead us through small group work by discipline
- Have a report back session

Allyson on data: ABBOT got started 3 yrs ago. Wanted to address rumor that ABB's moved out of Cambridge with the end of rent control, began looking at demographics.

It's a struggle to get this data because all blacks (immigrants and American born) are lumped together. ABBOT did our own research/data collection by looking at representation of American Born Blacks in programs in Cambridge.

Collected data from MSYEP (768 youth overall) of 412 black kids: 199 had parents born outside of U.S., 174 had parents born in U.S. Data was also collected from Youth works: 36 black youth out of 46 kids-60% had non-U.S. born parents.

From U.S. Census and American Community Survey (2008-2010) data it appears that approximately half (51%) of the black population in Cambridge is African-American and about 51% of American Born Blacks in Cambridge are under 5 years old.

Allyson reminded the audience that averages can mask details and we need to find out for sure what is true in our own organizations

Allyson summarized the report findings from focus groups (see report posted on CET web site). The 2 parent focus groups were made up of younger, low income ABB families. The stake holders' focus groups were ABB professionals with diverse backgrounds.

Donna commented, using film Unnatural Causes (about health care) as a resource: Immigrants generally come to this country with better health rates than ABBs, but the longer they are here, the more those rates begin to be the same as ABBs. This indicates that racism in the U.S. plays a bigger role than culture of origin in determining health rates.

Donna and Paul: Review of 4 elements of lens for viewing racism (individual; interpersonal; institutional; and cultural, how we frame this work (vision, mission and values) and what gets in the way: systemic racism and what to do about it: leadership practices. (Slides of Donna and Paul's presentation are on the CET web site.)

We live in one of the most racialized systems on the planet and second most segregated city in the country.

Review of definition of racism, rather than simply something individuals do it is personal prejudice + systemic power. Racism is a system that gets set up when one group has the power to shape policies/culture/etc. The institutionalization of racism is the power to institutionalize prejudice by making policies and defining culture. Who gets to set standards, determine what appropriate behavior is; ethnocentric; reflecting and privileging norms and values of dominant group. Who gets to define reality and define problem. Capacity to make/enforce decisions disproportionately and unfairly distributed leads to unequal access to resources ($, education, information, safe neighborhood, drinking water, etc.) In Mass. 94 or 95% of Blacks live in "low opportunity communities". Only 33% of Whites live in "low opportunity communities.

It is also true that changing policies alone won't succeed if we don't also pay attention to the individual and interpersonal. We have to pay attention to all 4 dimensions.

Small Group Activities:

1: Level 1 analysis (4-dimensions chart worksheet): review ABBOT focus group findings;   look at findings and try to determine which quadrant or dimension each belongs in. Put each finding in one of the 4-dimensions: (individual, interpersonal, institutional, cultural). Remember that the 4-dimensions are interconnected and interdependent.

Example: ABBs in Cambridge feel too proud to ask for help.

If want to add barriers specific to own discipline, can do that. *Question: where do we act if barriers at all dimensions? Answer: just expanding our view to include all 4 dimensions is useful.*

Label by discipline the paper to be handed in.

2: Fish Bone Diagram worksheet: Look at a cause or barriers holding a particular problem. Analysis causes of and effects of systemic racism: Donna gave an example of a project she's working on the Boston Busing Desegregation Project:

Individual: Individuals who were traumatized by busing or working against busing

Interpersonal: Had to look at how communities pitted against each other

Institutional: Making and forcing decisions – School Committee.

Cultural: Few people with decision making power, power to set educational standards, were people of color

Using the worksheet: the problem is the fish's head, use the bones to give examples of 4 dimensions, make sure to see system and include systemic solutions

(A complete write up of this activity is attached at the end of these notes.)

Activity 3: Write on index card one question and one insight.

(A complete write up of this activity is attached at the end of these notes.)

Large Group Discussion (Fish Bowl):

Why people hire based on comfort zone and looking like them can now see as institutionalized racism and cultural but all starts with an individual preference. Whites hire whites…all started with individual decision. One decision can go a long way!

Good definition of racism, not just about individual people. Why young African American men disproportionately arrested for minor crimes is institutional problem. A culture change would depend on young people who rebel. Solution has to come from them.

Hiring based on comfort versus likeness. The next generation incorporated diversified and changing things. Culture of our workforce is seeing difference in rank of staff by race (even though diverse front lines). Why are staff of color not moving up in the ranks? What might we do? Can create more space for people to talk about this and give internal voice, allowing staff to be role models-moving up. What is needed so they can gain more power in their institutions?

We need to talk and ask but also have to close the loop and do something. Need more follow up so it's not just "Why did you ask me?" Focus groups etc…open can of worms but then we don't follow up.

Example of 3 equally qualified women, but those hiring hired someone who wasn't representative of population being served. The women hiring, hired of their own race; those being served were of the race of those not hired.

Old example helpful: Babies being thrown in the river; people pulling them out but not dealing with why/who throwing them in. What does it mean to look at underlying realities? It is a commitment of time and resources.

At CCTV we have a positive environment and diverse staff. Want community-diversity needs to be there.

Need to be more intentional in hiring and firing. Have to have a plan to change face of staff. For example: intentional recruitment of Black teachers. Need to reach out and create a bigger pool.

Question: Where would you like to see this process go?
We should address segregation and people living in their bubbles. Need changes to make diversity a part of our everyday life.

Desegregation is a double edged sword. Because of segregation, don't have neighbors and friends across race. With desegregation we lose some of the clusters of support. How to expand our charge and resources?

Solution is deeper than today and multi-year, but where do we go from here? Getting to place where we're all comfortable to take a hard look at ourselves, our own organizations, our structures, and our leadership. Need to be brave to open up examples of where this is happening- scary undertaking vs. protecting where we

are- deciding as an organization that creating space and examining this is important.

Donna: This is a time of increasing need and decreasing resources. In our bussing desegregation group, we're looking at:
Internal: how to work toward individual achievement (achievement gap)
Interpersonal: Opportunity gap (different communities)
Institutional: Democracy gap: who's included, who gives input
Cultural: Power gap (the 99%): Who is setting the standards?
Recommend we look at achievement, opportunity, democracy, power.

Paul: It is a hard time, but important step back and understand that we need to step back and look at systemic issues. It's a long term commitment. We need to make change and step back/take time to understand that this is long term. This is a process that could end after we're all gone.

Michelle's Wrap-Up: We thought a lot about opening up this can of worms and leaving it. So make sure you fill out your evaluations. ABBOT is holding this now, but hopefully someone else will step up and take this on. Your survey feedback will help us shape the next event.

Notes will be up on the CET web site within the month.

ABBOT is meeting tomorrow to look at our proposal for this work and what's next

Carole's Reminder: CET can provide technical assistance if you need help making connections or figuring out next steps. Contact Carole.

Ellen's Announcement: Last night a bunch of youth-mostly African American and police officers held an event "In My Shoes"- a collaborative event of youth, OWD, and police.

Fish Bone Exercise

<u>Early Childhood Group</u>

Topic: Access to/Utilization of Quality Childcare

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
– Lack of trust that others are OK care providers – Lack of diversity of some programs – Economic – Knowledge – Transportation	– Need more ABB staff – Expectation of teachers U.S. child's need – Bad prior experience w/ individuals in the system – Common expectation not in place
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
– Testing emphasis – Schools need to be more committed to diversity – Expensive – Long wait – Complicated process to access – Not enough $ put into it – The information written by "whites" is not easily understood by "non whites" – Information needs to be clearer, easier words translated (for ELL) – Time limits – Provider rules – Doesn't cover cost of high quality care = stress on provider – Welfare rules – Rules of vouchers – Transportation – Not enough pre-school slots – $ freeze on vouchers – Access to information	– Is curriculum relevant to ABB experience – Need to push for more diversity in classes – In the past, you could call a neighbor or only want to use family members – Early childhood education not as valued – Difficulty admitting they need help and will not ask for services – Long history of mistrust – Behavioral norms of pre-school – Lack of people who look like me – Not enough slots – Cultural norms of families different than what preschool promotes – economics

Fish Bone Exercise

<u>Early Childhood Group</u>

Topic: Health Care

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
– Hard to ask for help – Embarrassment	– No funding for people who look like you
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
– Mistrust of system – Unequal resources – Expensive	

<u>Human Services</u>

Topic: Access to/Utilization of Services

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
– Understand history of racism – Know the culture	– Learn from mistakes – Don't make assumptions (share w/others) – Ask people – Makes friends-talk openly – Build relationships and trust – Share experiences – Acknowledge their experiences – Ask questions to learn more – Meet w/family, have positive mindset
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
– Be intentional – Ask ABB families about their needs and wants for programming – Have buddy families – Welcoming-pictures of many cultures including ABB – Hire some staff that are ABB	– Make sure organizations are strong that ABB families connect with – Connect w/agencies where ABB families go – Don't mess up first time because will lose families

Human Services

Topic: ABB Disproportionately Arrested

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
− Parent education and involvement − Youth education	− Understanding how to respond to the police
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
− Diversion program (to prevent young people from getting records) − Cambridge works (resources to provide employment for young people who have been arrested)	− Positive examples and messages in the media (youth could generate these) − Acknowledging that police do target young people of color

Human Services

Topic: Access to/Utilization of Mental Health Services

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
− Self-control −	− Expectations − Assumptions
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
− Money − Awareness − Access	− Stigma of "crazy" − Consequences − Peer pressure

Human Services

Topic: Systemic Racism in Rank in Organizations (especially education)

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
− Staff sharing personal stories, etc. about own situations for rank/position in job	− Use supervision to start asking questions − Be more open to hiring diverse staff
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
− How do you hold employees accountable, but also support or	− Kids stay on in familiar environments (youth center work for example),

understand issues	because that is what they know. They
− Look at data within own organization use data out there to analyze/compare own institution − Mentor programs within − Provide more training opportunities to move up in system − Provide more support to take those steps − Who makes the decision of hiring is affecting the right candidate for the position.	have not seen how to move on and expand career, etc. − Rejected or pushed back when tried to move up − Why are people not moving into higher positions? What about culture/feelings do people perceive or ignore related to "staying in their place" − Fear of moving up, leaving comfort of the familiar, etc.

Human Services

Topic: Hiring Practices

INDIVIDUAL	**INTERPERSONAL**
− Comfort level people hiring who looks like them and who they are comfortable with	− Increase comfort level by being exposed to diversity
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
− Singular image − One group dominated/dictates − Even regional companies hire under the CEO standard − More studies show that diverse team is more beneficial for the company − Singular group makes decisions − Hiring people we're comfortable with even if they are not qualified −	− Which men in power − Culturally all white men − Exposure to diversity "diversity is good − Globalization-global voices makes change − White people make decisions − Broaden horizons − Exposure by diversity =knowledge

Fish Bone Exercise

<u>Public Health/Safety/Legal</u>

Topic: Mistrust of Health System

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
− Experiences w/ health system, family, personal, not getting services, being disrespected, knowledge of Tuskegee, crisis intervention − Shame/blame/judgment	− Being disrespected
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
− Where does the information go, will they get in trouble for other problems − Take the blame off the individual	− Media and messages of health disparities affect institution and individual interactions − Self fulfilling prophecies

<u>Education</u>

Topic: Percentage of ABB Students Attending Colleges w/Low Graduation Rates

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
	− Role of parent to push child- being accountable − Role of parent to be responsive − Teacher not knowing how to distinguish between two young black girls
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
− Leadership obligation because impact of not graduating college is so significant − Not every young person has access to school based strong guidance − School ownership of need to keep reaching out because of history of families − City ownership of this as well − Are expectations the same	− Idea that young black men being funneled towards sports rather than academic route to college

Fish Bone Exercise

Education

Topic: Underrepresentation of ABB Students in honors & AP Classes at CRLS

INDIVIDUAL	INTERPERSONAL
– When does it start/ it starts before kindergarten. That's why we have Baby U – Discrepancy in what families can do and have for their kids – Parents are more focused on kids having a good peer group, not getting into trouble	– Kids want peers-don't want to be like the "geniuses" or like "them" – Identification w/a peer group – Parents also struggle w/identifying w/a parent peer group
INSTITUTIONAL: *making and reinforcing decision, access to resources broadly defined (money, time, information, etc.)*	**CULTURAL**: *naming reality, defining the problem, setting standards and norms*
– Cambridge has a <u>huge</u> income discrepancy. A tale of two cities – School administration wants to retain middle class families – Enrichment for kids who can't afford it – Teaching to the middle, because of wide range of students – Teachers don't have high expectations of all children of different races – Need for teacher training and professional development – It's hard for families to stay in Cambridge. Families that start in Baby U end up leaving the city. – Need for systemic change – Multi prong approach, teachers, parents, system, recruitment, finds to make it work well	– Setting a holistic high standard, convey message – "Yes you can." E.g.: Welfare program available to public housing and section 8 families – A lot of support for kids w/help, college prep, tutoring – To lay foundation universal pre-kindergarten – It's a societal problem not just a Cambridge problem – See the child as an individual w/ a set of needs. The new MTSS @ state level. But needs to become part of school culture norm

Index Card Exercise

Insights

-I need to train more of my staff on privilege – the system of racism.

-I learned that reasons for barriers to racism happen at all 4 levels (Individual, interpersonal, cultural, and institutional and creates a complex problem to solve. It requires a lot of effort and commitment to change the status quo.

-I've learned so much from this workshop today but I like the most the definition of racism.

-I've learned that racism is still a problem today.

-I was aware that Cambridge does not recognize many black cultural holidays. There should be more celebrations for EVERYONE'S culture/background.

-I have a better understanding of the definition of racism.

-Great knowledge from purple group members- wonderful discussion.

-Individual decisions can go a long way.

-I learned that we need to give attention for all cultures and they have their specific needs and value. All programs and services can be useful if used and connected with the right individual.

-4 dimensions very complicated for all of us and even more for people who are immigrants – we got very tangled up in the cultural definition- so used to "ethnic" culture.

-Most issues have a dimension in each of one 4- somewhat hard sometimes to sort between institutional & cultural.

-Some topics are very personally meaningful and people find it hard to go beyond direct personal experience to broader issues of the community.

-Most of the issues discussed fell into all 4 categories.

-The schools cannot be held responsible for everything.

-"Legal" language can be an institutional barrier to access.

-I found it interesting to hear about the need to promote career paths for American born blacks within the work force in Cambridge (particularly, within the OST/Youth focused programs) with the change it could mean more community members represented throughout the system and changing the institution.

-Many of our solutions lead to the need of both financial and expert resources.

-The epidemic institutionalization of racism needs to be addressed on all levels (organizations, local, state and national).

-Many other youth organizations are also grappling with recruitment & retention of American born black candidates to join staff.

-People (in positions of leadership) see the ABB youth workers who haven't been able to be promoted in their organizations & recognize the problem. That first step is validating in itself.

-Within youth program professionals we all agree with the lack of support and incentive to see American born blacks move up the hierarchy in an institution and that we need to begin to really reach out to
Change this reality.

-It was really valuable to do small groups with colleagues/disciplines.

-We do sometimes open up these discussions among ourselves, our students, or families but don't follow up very well, if at all.

-Some of the barriers that prevent access to quality care in Cambridge.

-What a complex issue racism is & what a long term process that requires persistent care, thought, strategy & dialogue, it will take to make a difference. We haven't even started talking about steps to take---or we do see how ingrained institutional racism is, but it is hard to see where to start.

-In order to really make a difference in reaching out to American born blacks, we need to think about the root of the matter on a bigger systemic level.   I don't think it's a matter of pride; it's a matter of internalizing oppression.

-Some issues fall within all 4 categories of racism.

-Talking about racial disparities/culture or race is a living organism! It needs to be a continuous conversation or workshop that institutions, individuals can talk and listen to the work being done. Or where there are disparities.

-Long way to go, good start but we need to put things into practice.

-Frontline staff is key, every interaction counts, but, even if you make institutions "welcoming" that are not enough make real progress in addressing racism. You need to say that the institution will address racism & take steps needed to specifically reach out & address that.

-We need to have more conversations about race.

-Brings up so many questions and so few answers.

-It's hard for me to separate some of these issues as being relevant for ABB vs. issues that many poor immigrant communities have, however the idea of whether education will move you forward for ABB is, I think, an important question to address.

-Getting diverse child care & preschool -need for more understanding of about the community – better engagement of strategies.

-I love the model for analysis it shows the complexity of racism, also the exercise to plot the problem in the 4 quadrants showed how interrelated all the issues are.

-Lots of confusion at our table in our very diverse group. I was surprised to hear a lot of internalized racism. Talk of people abusing systems of housing, criticism of teens. I didn't feel written group exercise worked well in my group.

-I liked the acknowledgement that not all black people are African Americans there are different types of blacks. It's great that we can discuss this topic.

-That event was focusing on "Black" community or all other colors; everyone has his own experience.

Questions

How to make an impact on these issues feel so big and daunting, where or how to start? Are there any lessons to be learned from talking about the experience of racism of folks of color born outside of the United States? Are there things to be learned from this?

Helping low income black families with children that need daycare and cannot afford it due to vouchers are not available and the waiting list is too long, why is there such a long process?

How are you all able to gather data accurately, from all American born blacks, if many people are identifying themselves as being bicultural or biracial?

How do you convey to those in power, the benefits of changing institutions and practices to be more equitable?

Is the racism over? If not, how can we work to get it over?

How can we get ABB into programs?

Why has Cambridge chosen not to take part in celebrating more black holidays?

How can you connect African Americans to their history so they develop appreciation for their past?

In Cambridge, due to housing insecurity, how can we ensure those families support early on so they can stay in and contribute to Cambridge as their families grow?

Are there any bright spots? Are there any youth organizations that are successful in recruiting and retention of ABB candidates?

How are institutions/organizations to approach schools? There are challenges during a time when funds are greatly limited.

We always categorize American Born Black and Foreign Born, but how much does the country of origin in Africa, Caribbean, etc… play a role in sub identification cultural and institutional outcomes? (Here, I am thinking of the American Born descendants.)

What are the next moves to help make change across all the 4 dimensions?

How do we create an atmosphere for program/dept management & leadership to look at questions & revise their policies and procedures?

What can we do as a society to reach out and begin to ask why American Born Blacks are not moving up the hierarchy of industries and support them or provide resources to really consider their responses?

How do we support individuals and organizations that were here, in taking this work back and pursuing it or moving it to the next level? How do we reach those who weren't here to continue to promote this work? Also can we get more citywide data & track more program data on these demographics?

How do we break the trend on non-ABB being hired for higher end positions in our educational institutions?

How does ABBOTT reach out to the American born black community in Cambridge to get them involved?

What can be done in Cambridge to support black people more? Also, how can we make the school system better? For example, the Fletcher Maynard School, how can we desegregate that population?

What do you do when your institution is racist in all 4 quadrants? Ugh!

Brings up so many questions and so few answers, where do we go from here?

How do we have these conversations and what do we take from it?

Can you help us shape the next step?

Where do we go from here? How do we continue the conversation throughout our organization? Is it enough to focus on the "front line"?

Where can institutions get better resources like these worksheets to bring back and work on their own teams?

What can we do to make quality early childhood education accessible & affordable to all those who need it?

How do we understand more about the perception of reality & standards for behavior?

How will we change how we follow up with ourselves, students, and families? What will we do as a result of today to really move this forward, close the loop, and follow up?

How can we better connect with American born blacks?

What is the obligation of "historically" ABB institutions to aggressively engage with the ABB populations?

Do you think that salary/wages differ in race?

How to get the information to the people that really need it?

What is the next step?

How can we change the institutions?

To what extent are individuals personally responsible and to what extent should institutions and communities take responsibility? (i.e. family engagement in schools)

Is it possible to have some TV or radio advertisement that can help outreach be more effective in their work?

How do we make it easier for families in our community approach free services without feeling ashamed or afraid to accept them?

How do we let families know about the programs being used currently?

Will you have another part to this class?

How can we address racism more openly & in a way that is integrated into daily conversation & daily life in Cambridge?

Why not include high income people for this research?

How to utilize information about the uniqueness of Cambridge demographics and economics to formulate a plan to address a number of issues discussed today?

Where is the Cambridge public school in this discussion?

How can American Born Blacks and immigrants create a safe place to discuss and solve their differences in order to work more closely together to combat racism?